#### Markus Riedel, PhD student

# **Summary of Fieldwork PhD Project: Introducing Primary Education in** the Multidialectal Language **Complex Taa in Botswana**

#### Contents

## Fieldwork at Nyae Nyae Village Schools

- Jul'hoan: SE variety of !Xun dialect continuum
- Spoken in NE Namibia and NW Botswana
- Recent hunter-gatherers
  - Similar socio-economic circumstances to Taa speakers

 Nyae Nyae Conservancy, Northeastern Namibia, Otjozondjupa region.



Map 1: Nyae Nyae Conservancy

#### Source:

https://news.mongabay.com/2 019/02/it-pays-but-does-itstay-hunting-in-namibiascommunity-conservationsystem/ jgrobler\_nyaenyae\_mapnamibi a

4

# Jul'hoan language in Nyae Nyae

- Jul'hoan spoken by all ages and social groups (except in central town of Tsumkwe)
- low standing, declining
- language in transition from oracy to literacy
  - Jul'hoan Transcription Group: Transcription of oral stories

• 4 weeks of fieldwork in February 2024

# Fieldwork at Nyae Nyae Village Schools

#### Methodology:

- Participant Observation
  - Classes at different schools
  - Activities during and after school
  - mainly in the villages Denlui and llAuru
  - short visit to school in Duin Pos, failed attempts to visit school in IlXaloba
- Interviews
  - mainly with Village School teachers
  - with parents, with local community members
- Assessment of teaching materials

# Fieldwork at Nyae Nyae Village Schools

Nyae Nyae Village Schools:

- 6 schools
- 3 years from grade 1 to grade 3
- Mother-tongue education in Jul'hoan, English as a foreign language, Afrikaans widely spoken, but not taught
- state schools, teaching according to Namibian state curriculum
  - dependent on external funding
- relatively familar environment for children
- culturally sensitive teaching, teaching of traditional knowledge
- Additionally inclusion of local communities in decision-making

# Available school materials in Jul'hoan

- text books for all school subjects
- small storybooks
- Colour printed booklets with short stories
- simple photocopied short textbooks
- a Children's Picture Dictionary
- printed and hand-written posters
- dictionary not available
  - wish to reissue and expand dictionary

#### **Condition of schools**

- some modern school complexes
- some old, too small complexes
- Duin Pos: school tent
- lack of resources
  - copying machine, playground equipment, toys
  - no funds for renovation
    - Denlui School: cattle enters school area
- lack of rooms: classrooms used as hostels
  - 1 of 2 classrooms unavailable for class

#### **Use of materials**

- Text books:
  - limited availability, no funds to reprint books
  - distributed to children, collected again at the end of class
- Booklets:
  - Read aloud to class, Jul'hoan and English

# **Teaching style, pedagogics**

- Less strict and more free than among dominating ethnic groups
- Learners-centred education
  - Group work, stronger and weaker children learn together
  - More strict style in llAuru
    - Poorer results in schooling
- Tolerance towards temporary absence
  - Enrolled pupils attend classes well

#### **Parents' opinions**

- Diverting opinions
  - Dissatisfaction: Some teachers out of village too often
  - Positive view: Teachers teach children well
    - Children learn well thanks to culturally sensitive approach

#### In Botswana:

- School in !Aoan
- No MTE yet
  - Parents wish for MTE for their children

#### **Transition to state schools**

- Transition to state schools is very difficult
  - Misunderstandings, discrimination
    - No readiness of teachers to treat Jul'hoan children in a different way
  - High dropout rates, children get thrown out of school
- Tensions between teachers of VS and state schools
  - Rigid mindsets of state school teachers
    - Paternalistic attitudes
  - Prejudice against Jul'hoan children and teachers
- No provisions for needs of culturally different children

# Jul'hoan in Omaheke

- Jul'hoan is less spoken than in Nyae Nyae
  - code-switching with Afrikaans

- No Jul'hoan mother-tongue education
  - one pre-school with Jul'hoan lessons
  - one primary school with some Jul'hoan after school
    - From several teachers, one is left nowadays
    - Not a mother-tongue speaker

#### **Gqaina Primary School**

- large and fully equipped school
- ethnically mixed, children speaking different languages
- voluntary Jul'hoan lessons after school
  - continuation of currently taught topics in Jul'hoan
  - no mother-tongue speaking teachers
- Reading: children can read basic clicks well, but not clicks in combination with other consonant letters such as llk or n<sup>‡</sup>
- photocopied draft Jul'hoan-English dictionary



Baqu ku kare nom Ixoa dxuu. Nuu n'ae ku n'arih q!ulho ka mi se. Debe ku, Ilkoa lxoa waqrawaqra ko farma. Mi ku !hai aia ko ka da a kuni tsi g!a. Illi ko ha ti Iha dxuu n'om Ixoa.

#### **Fieldwork in Botswana**

#### March 2024: Workshop with Taa speakers

April 2024: Fieldwork

- Taa-speaking community in Ngwatle
- Nama-speaking community in Lokgwabe

## Introduction of Mother-tongue education

- Languages to be introduced in two phases
  - <sup>–</sup> Phase 1 languages were introduced in 2023
  - Phase 2 languages are to be introduced in future
- First in reception class, then gradual introduction into higher grades
  - <sup>–</sup> Up to grade 2
  - Wish by many to introduce mother-tongue education into higher grades
- Teacher aides are responsible for translating teaching content

## Introduction of Mother-tongue education

#### Job description of teacher aide:

- Translate between Setswana/English and mother tongue
  - Question: What about translation of concepts?
- Assist teacher
- Develop materials
- Supervise children
- Contact with community members in mother tongue



#### **Fieldwork in Botswana**



Map 2: Map of Taa dialects. Source: Naumann 2014: 289.

21

## Nama Community in Lokgwabe

• Language: Namagowab (same as Khoekhoegowab)

History:

- 1908: fled from German "Schutztruppen" into Botswana
  - led by Kaptein Simon lGomxab Kooper
- after battle 1909: settled in Lokgwabe
  - in the middle of Shekgalagari-speaking area
- Current Chief: Gaob Charles Gert Cooper



# Identity of Nama in Lokgwabe

#### Language: "Namagowab"

- Government adopted this name
- "Khoekhoegowab" feels foreign
  - Different orthography
  - Influence from Tswana, no influence from Afrikaans
  - Standard has "lowered", indicator of language 'fading away'
- yet able to relate to Khoekhoegowab
- Simpler modern orthography of Khoekhoegowab may benefit children more
- ZA Nama: failures to create own separate teaching materials

- Nama was a medium of education before independence
- Decline after independence:
  - first, language was passed on
  - language shift towards Shekgalagari
  - not because of disinterest; because of external pressure

- Literacy: elders have continued reading: Bible, Nama hymn
  - awareness of differences towards Khoekhoegowab version
- Children do not know Namagowab anymore, some passive knowledge
- Language loss seems to be considered a kind of negligence
  - elders: feel failure to pass language on: have failed and continue to fail
  - overpowered by dominant languages

# **Introduction of Mother-Tongue Education in Nama**

- Namagowab was prominent in education before 1966
  - Skilled teachers, Coetzee, speakers benefitted from his contributions
- No mother-tongue education after independence
  - Assimilationist policy
- Introduced into mother-tongue education in 2023
  - Was to be introduced at phase 2 (languages without materials)
  - after protests introduced at phase 1 (languages with developed materials)
  - Teacher aide at Lokgwabe school (and a Kgalagari teacher aide)
- Wish for own language as a medium of education

## **Introduction of Mother-Tongue Education in Nama**

- Speakers welcome mother-tongue education initiative, excitement
- A future is coming to the community and their language
- Reasons for mother-tongue education:
  - makes children understand instructions
  - mutual interest in each others' languages, open-mindedness, enrichment of diversity
  - builds confidence in children
  - equ(al)ity
  - sense of pride of who they are; no shame of who they are: "I am like any other"

# **Introduction of Mother-Tongue Education in Nama**

#### **Expectations to Nama teachers:**

- more than a job: inspiring others to use language
- need for dedication, teaching Nama at grassroots level
  Teacher aide:
- From a Nama-speaking Herero community
- A different Nama variety from the one parents speak: children can not follow instructions well
  - cultural difference: "can't relate to Nama texts"
  - <sup>–</sup> difference in dialect: "clicks are not pronounced right"
  - <sup>–</sup> quality of MTE gets compromised
- Not familiar with teaching materials
- Community seems ready to support her



# Jontaxtses ogô Mandaxtses Dentaxtses WUNStaxtses Dondertaxtsēs no traitaxtses Satertaxtsēs

30

#### **Challenges to Nama Mother-Tongue Education**

- Creating Textbooks in own variety of Namagowab
- Language loss in younger generation
  - Language revitalisation
- Sometimes tense relation with Kgalagari majority
- Teaching staff
  - Lack of young mother-tongue speakers in community

#### Wishes of Nama speakers

- Wish to sustain language
- Wish for a teacher who teaches how to read and write Nama
  - Wish for outside help
  - perhaps also from Namibian government
- Projects that reach youngsters as a target group
  - Luring interest into mother tongue
  - e.g. a project for one year with a prize to win
- Teachings, trainings, workshops
  - adult literacy education
- Tailor-made approaches for communities
- Need for translations of Afrikaans and German documentation into Nama and English

#### Fieldwork among Taa speakers

- Fieldwork in April 2024
- Original plan: visiting several settlements
- short visits with interviews in Inalegolo and Ukwi
- Longer visit only in Ngwatle
- Visiting Ngwatle School
  - Primary School, up to grade 8
- Interviews with Taa and Bakgalagari
- Starting recording and transcription of stories

#### Fieldwork among Taa speakers



Map 2: Map of Taa dialects. Source: Naumann 2014: 289.

34

### Taa in Inalegolo: Tshaasi and ‡Huan

- Two varieties next to each other: Tshaasi and #Huan
- Curriculum is good
- Wish for Taa mother-tongue education to be introduced
- Children should learn local variety
  - Children have knowledge of Tshaasi and *+*Huan
  - should learn Taa, Shekgalagari, Setswana and English
- Government should employ 1 teacher and 1 teacher aide each for Tshaasi and +Huan

#### Taa speakers in Ngwatle

- Taa-speaking community in Ngwatle
  - About 300 Taa speakers (Gachette Njagi 2005: 11)
- Speakers of the !Ama variety
- Languages in Ngwatle: Shekgalagari, Taa ‡aan, few Nama speakers



## Taa language in Ngwatle

**Decline of Taa language:** 

- knowledge of Taa ‡aan is dramatically declining in youngest generations, most spoken language is Shekgalagari
- Children are often of mixed-ethnic descent
- Wish to keep Taa language alive
- Closely intertwined with cultural/indigenous knowledge



Interviews with Bakgalagari:

- Generally support introduction of Taa ‡aan
- Relation Taa–Kgalagari: good on the surface. "are cousins and brothers"
- Mother-tongue education as an opportunity to learn each other's languages

#### Mother-tongue education in Taa

When asking about challenges in MTE:

- interviewees do not come up with challenges
- expectation that groups support each other

- General opinion: teach MT up to the level of full mastery
  - then switching to education in other languages is easier
  - matches with scientific findings





#### Mother-tongue education in Taa

**Impressions in Ngwatle Primary School:** 

- Kgalagari and Taa pupils
  - Mother-tongue education needs to cater for both languages
- So far: English and Setswana only
- 1 teacher aide
  - Translates into Shekgalagari, but can also translate into Taa ‡aan
- Attitude of teacher supportive to Taa language education:
  - When class speaks Taa ‡aan: "wow, beautiful, that sound"
  - "Even children don't know how to speak Sesarwa, frustrating"

#### • Lessons in different languages:

- mutual recognition, understanding
- when not knowing each others' languages: mistrust, fear of gossiping, ethnic tensions

#### • Government concerns about tribalism:

- MTE helps against tribalism
- learning MT and discrimination are more important issues than tribalism

# **Opinions on Primer Options**

- Diverting opinions
  - Speakers of peripheral varieties prefer multidialectal primers
  - Speakers of central varieties have diverting opinions
  - If introduced to the idea of primers with several standards, general support of this idea





#### **Options for a Primer**

- 1. One primer, one standard
- 2. Several standards, several primers
- - One primer with several standards
  - 3. One main variety
  - 4. Two main varieties on opposite pages
  - 5. Separate chapters for varieties





#### •

